

## Clark County Board of Equalization - Board Clerk's Record of Hearing

### CASE BEING HEARD

|                  |  |              |       |                |            |
|------------------|--|--------------|-------|----------------|------------|
| Assessment Year: | 2023   | Petition No: | 403   | Parcel Number: | 112810-000 |
| Owner Name:      | REGENCY APARTMENTS VANCOUVER LLC                       |              |       |                |            |
| Situs Address:   | 11301 SE 10TH ST VANCOUVER, WA 98664                   |              |       |                |            |
| Property Type:   | multi-family unit                                      | Acres:       | 15.23 | NBHD           | 8060       |
| Mailing Address: | 203 SE PARK PLAZA DRIVE, SUITE 230 VANCOUVER, WA 98684 |              |       |                |            |

### ATTENDANCE

|  |                      |                    |                         |  |
|--|----------------------|--------------------|-------------------------|--|
| Held by: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Video Conference <input type="checkbox"/> Phone Conference <input type="checkbox"/> In-Person   |                      |                    |                         |  |
| Board:   | Taxpayer:            | Assessor:          | Third Parties (if any): |  |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Daniel Weaver <input type="checkbox"/> John Rose<br><input type="checkbox"/> Lisa Bodner <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Terry Hagberg<br><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> John Marks <input type="checkbox"/> Gloria Gomez-Matthews<br><input type="checkbox"/> Joel Cline | <i>Greg Palblana</i> | <i>Keri Dudley</i> |                         |  |

### HEARING SESSION

|                  |                        |           |                 |
|------------------|------------------------|-----------|-----------------|
| Hearing Held On: | Start Time:            | End Time: | Recording Name: |
| March 19, 2024   | <del>10:00</del> 10:00 | 10:45     |                 |

### CASE DETAILS

**TESTIMONY:** (See attached note sheet)

**APPELLANT EVIDENCE:** The appellant submitted an income approach analysis indicating a value of \$216,354 per unit and a total value of \$57,983,000. The appellant's evidence included a multi-family submarket report, rent roll from January 2023, and a net operating income report as of December 2022. The appellant submitted six comparable sales [#163726-000 sold for \$23,920,000 in May 2022; #122646-000 sold for \$57,150,000 in May 2022; #112802-000 sold for \$17,200,000 in December 2021; #160746-000 sold for \$18,200,000 in October 2021; #200193-000 sold for \$35,550,000 in August 2021; and #161656-000 sold for \$23,850,000 in August 2021].

**ASSESSOR EVIDENCE:** The Assessor's evidence included four sales, a map showing the proximity of comparable sales to the subject property, photos and an aerial photo of the property, an income capitalization approach, and a cover letter recommending no change to the assessed value.

### DECISION OF THE BOARD

|  | ASSESSOR VALUE:      | BOE VALUE:              | DETERMINATION:   |  |
|--|----------------------|-------------------------|--|--|
| LAND (ACRES)   | \$ 7,324,143         | \$ <del>7,324,143</del> | <input type="checkbox"/> Sustained<br><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Changed<br><input type="checkbox"/> _____  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Appellant Analysis<br><input type="checkbox"/> Assessor Recomdtn |
| IMPROVEMENTS   | \$ 52,960,957        | \$ 50,658,857           |  |  |
| PERSONAL PROPERTY  | \$                   | \$                      |  |  |
| <b>TOTAL</b>   | <b>\$ 60,285,100</b> | <b>\$ 57,983,000</b>    |  |  |
| <b>NOTES:</b> <i>Appellant Analysis - Current actual data<br/>           - Compare to sales - older units - no upgrades<br/>           - Does not include bulk</i> |                      |                         | <input type="checkbox"/> Purchase <input type="checkbox"/> Repairs<br><input type="checkbox"/> Appraisal <input type="checkbox"/> Manfst Err.<br><input type="checkbox"/> Comps <input type="checkbox"/> Other |  |

### AUTHORIZATION

|  |                |
|--|----------------|
| Chairperson (or Authorized Designee) Signature | Date           |
| <i>Daniel C. Weiser</i>                        | <i>3/19/24</i> |

**Clark County Board of Equalization - Board Clerk's Record of Hearing**

**CASE BEING HEARD**

|                  |  |              |      |                |            |
|------------------|--|--------------|------|----------------|------------|
| Assessment Year: | 2023   | Petition No: | 402  | Parcel Number: | 165394-000 |
| Owner Name:      | BLOCK 1618 LLC   |              |      |                |            |
| Situs Address:   | 1618 NE 112TH AVE VANCOUVER, WA 98684                  |              |      |                |            |
| Property Type:   | multi-family unit                                      | Acres:       | 2.74 | NBHD           | 8060       |
| Mailing Address: | 203 SE PARK PLAZA DRIVE, SUITE 230 VANCOUVER, WA 98684 |              |      |                |            |

**ATTENDANCE**

|   |  |   |                                    |
|---|--|---|------------------------------------|
| Held by:  | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Video Conference | <input type="checkbox"/> Phone Conference | <input type="checkbox"/> In-Person |
| Board:  | Taxpayer:  | Assessor:                                 | Third Parties (if any):            |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Daniel Weaver<br><input type="checkbox"/> Lisa Bodner<br><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> John Marks<br><input type="checkbox"/> John Rose<br><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Terry Hagberg<br><input type="checkbox"/> Gloria Gomez-Matthews<br><input type="checkbox"/> Joel Cline | Greg LeBlanc   | Keri Dudley                               |                                    |

**HEARING SESSION**

|                  |                      |                      |                 |
|------------------|----------------------|----------------------|-----------------|
| Hearing Held On: | Start Time:          | End Time:            | Recording Name: |
| March 19, 2024   | <del>9:10</del> 9:10 | <del>9:59</del> 9:59 |                 |

**CASE DETAILS**

**TESTIMONY:** (See attached note sheet)

**APPELLANT EVIDENCE:** The appellant submitted an income approach analysis indicating a value of \$222,148 per unit. The appellant's evidence included a multi-family submarket report, rent roll from January 2023, and income report as of December 2022 and December 2021. The appellant submitted six comparable sales [#12448-002 sold for \$6,935,000 in June 2022; #163726-000 sold for \$23,920,000 in May 2022; #160818-000 sold for \$13,972,000 in May 2022; #160746-000 sold for \$18,200,000 in October 2021; #986056-457 sold for \$7,022,634 in August 2021; and #986048-471 sold for \$20,500,000 in September 2020].

**ASSESSOR EVIDENCE:** The Assessor's evidence included three sales, a map showing the proximity of comparable sales to the subject property, photos and an aerial photo of the property, an income capitalization approach, and a cover letter recommending no change to the assessed value.

**DECISION OF THE BOARD**

|  | ASSESSOR VALUE:      | BOE VALUE:           | DETERMINATION:  |  |
|--|----------------------|----------------------|---|--|
| LAND (ACRES)   | \$ 1,317,672         | \$ 1,317,672         | <input type="checkbox"/> Sustained<br><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Changed<br><input type="checkbox"/> _____ | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Appellant Analysis<br><input type="checkbox"/> Assessor Recomdtn       |
| IMPROVEMENTS   | \$ 13,557,528        | \$ 12,233,328        |   |  |
| PERSONAL PROPERTY  | \$                   | \$                   |   |  |
| <b>TOTAL</b>   | <b>\$ 14,875,200</b> | <b>\$ 13,551,000</b> |   |  |
| <b>NOTES:</b> Appellant analysis - current actual data - compare to sales - older units - no upgrades - does not use a bulk % adjustment<br>Assessor sales do not adjust for amenities |                      |                      | <input type="checkbox"/> Purchase<br><input type="checkbox"/> Appraisal<br><input type="checkbox"/> Comps           | <input type="checkbox"/> Repairs<br><input type="checkbox"/> Manfst Err.<br><input type="checkbox"/> Other |

**AUTHORIZATION**

|  |         |
|--|---------|
| Chairperson (or Authorized Designee) Signature | Date    |
| <i>Daniel C. Weaver</i>                        | 3/19/24 |

| Owner                            | PID       | Case | Mail                               | ATD                          | NOTES  |
|----------------------------------|-----------|------|------------------------------------|------------------------------|--|
| BLOCK 1618 LLC                   | 165394000 | 402  | 203 SE PARK PLAZA DRIVE, SUITE 230 | Greg LeBlanc and Keri Dudley | <p>The subject property consists of 6 two story apartment buildings with 61 rentable units.</p> <p>The complex has a mix of studio, 1-bedroom, and 2-bedroom, units with an average unit size of 792 square feet. It is 88.5% occupied. It contains stainless steel appliances, quartz counters, washers and dryers, and hood microwaves. It does not have many common area features. With the loaded capitalization rate of 5.97%, the income approach yields a value of \$13,551,000 or \$222,148 per unit. The comparable sales range between \$204,926 and \$224,049 per unit after adjustments were made for age, building features, and amenities. All of the comparable sales were built between 2015 and 2022 with more desirable shared amenities than the subject property. The appellant pointed out that the Assessor's Office's Sale #1 and Sale #2 had larger average unit size and superior amenities compared to the subject property.</p> <p>The Assessor's Office's representative stated a deed of trust was recorded for \$8,256,000 on December 10<sup>th</sup>, 2021. An income approach in 2021 resulted in a value of \$10,779,100 and was combined with a 2022 sales comparison approach to result in a value of \$14,875,200. The 2021 income approach included a market adjustment of \$4,096,100 based on analysis of 2022 comparable sales. The Assessor's Office presented three comparable sales from 2022 with a range in value of \$250,000 to \$270,897 per unit. Sale #1 had a similar construction date and location to the subject property. The CoStar report pulled by the Assessor's Office differs from the appellant's showing that third party reports can result in conflicting information.</p> |
| REGENCY APARTMENTS VANCOUVER LLC | 112810000 | 403  | 203 SE PARK PLAZA DRIVE, SUITE 230 | Greg LeBlanc and Keri Dudley | <p>The subject property is a garden-style complex constructed in 1995 with 268 units and located near Mill Plain Blvd. The appellant's representative stated that average unit size is 1,029 square feet. The apartments have washers and dryers but have not been updated in several years. Amenities include a clubhouse, fitness center, outdoor pool, and car ports. In the income approach, a loaded capitalization rate of 5.97% was used to yield a value of \$57,983,000 or \$216,354 per unit. The appellant's five comparable sales range in similarity to the subject property with comparable construction dates, location, and size. When adjusted for age, location, market conditions, unit features, and unit size, the comparable sales yield an average value of \$224,537 per unit. The appellant believes that the subject property should be at the lower range of comparable sales. The</p>  |

appellant pointed out the superior quality of the Assessor's Office's sales.

The Assessor's Office inspected the property on March 30<sup>th</sup>, 2021. A deed of trust was recorded on March 18, 2021, for \$15,000,000. The 2021 income approach yielded a value of \$43,684,900, and with a market adjustment of \$16,660,200 from 2022 comparable sales, the Assessor arrived at a blended value of \$60,285,100. A loaded capitalization rate of 6.1% was used for the 2021 income assessment. Four comparable sales from 2022 were provided. Two sales were portfolio sales which might show a discounted value, but these sales still support the assessment. All sales have comparable number of units, unit mix, and construction year. The most weight was placed on Comparable Sale #1 because of location, size, and construction date, but it does not have a gated entrance, washer and dryers, or air conditioners like the subject property so can be considered inferior.